Empirical Bayesian Geographical Mapping of Occupational Accidents among Iranian Workers

Nasim Vahabi PhD¹, Anoshirvan Kazemnejad PhD², Somnath Datta PhD²

Abstract

Background: Work-related accidents are believed to be a serious preventable cause of mortality and disability worldwide. This study aimed to provide Bayesian geographical maps of occupational injury rates among workers insured by the Iranian Social Security Organization.

Methods: The participants included all insured workers in the Iranian Social Security Organization database in 2012. One of the applications of the Bayesian approach called the Poisson-Gamma model was applied to estimate the relative risk of occupational accidents. Data analysis and mapping were performed using R 3.0.3, Open-Bugs 3.2.3 rev 1012 and ArcMap9.3.

Results: The majority of all 21,484 investigated occupational injury victims were male (98.3%) including 16,443 (76.5%) single workers aged 20 – 29 years. The accidents were more frequent in basic metal, electric, and non-electric machining jobs. About 0.4% (96) of work-related accidents led to death, 2.2% (457) led to disability (partial and total), 4.6% (980) led to fixed compensation, and 92.8% (19,951) of the injured victims recovered completely. The geographical maps of estimated relative risk of occupational accidents were also provided. The results showed that the highest estimations pertained to provinces which were mostly located along mountain chains, some of which are categorized as deprived provinces in Iran.

Conclusions: The study revealed the need for further investigation of the role of economic and climatic factors in high risk areas. The application of geographical mapping together with statistical approaches can provide more accurate tools for policy makers to make better decisions in order to prevent and reduce the risks and adverse outcomes of work-related accidents.

Keywords: Empirical Bayes, Iran, Poisson-gamma, work-related accidents

Introduction

Work-related accidents are among the most serious preventable health problems around the world. These accidents contribute to considerable mental and physical consequences in most developed and developing countries. Additionally, they have serious economic and social impacts due to the fatality, disability, and other adverse effects that they cause during the individuals’ productive periods.1,2 Because of these catastrophic outcomes, scientific evidence based on relevant studies is needed in order to develop promotional and preventive activities.3-5 Many previous studies have investigated the patterns of occupational fatal injuries in different societies, but the geography and the epidemiological distribution of work-related accidents have not received enough attention.6-13

To improve the available knowledge on fatal and disabling patterns of work-related accidents, epidemiological research can be helpful in evaluating the effectiveness of past preventive actions and showing the extent of such events in the society to policymakers.12-14 Investigating disease incidence or mortality rates by epidemiological disease mapping is the best way to determine disease etiology. In these maps, areas with the highest and lowest rates of accidents are of particular importance and analytic epidemiologic studies can be conducted to identify etiologic factors in these regions.15

In disease mapping, standardized mortality ratios (SMRs) and standardized incidence ratios (SIRs) are two important measures which rank the relative risks by color codes in corresponding regions. Most of the time, researchers focus on moderate to high relative risk areas, but often the regions with higher risks receive more attention. In many cases, one faces heterogeneity of populations in small areas which leads to unreliable and imprecise estimations. Reliable estimation methods have been developed to solve this problem and adjust the effect of such inconsistency.16-18

Smoothing methods and hierarchical models such as generalized linear mixed models are commonly used to take the heterogeneity and spatial correlations into account and to calculate robust estimates. These estimations can be made using either a classical likelihood function or Bayesian methods; the former does not require additional assumptions on population heterogeneity.19,20

Smoothing methods such as kernel regression, Kriging, and partition methods are some useful nonparametric methods which are distribution free.21,22 Comparing Bayesian and smoothing methods, it has been suggested that modeling using Bayesian inference yields more precise and reliable estimates.23 Bayesian models include empirical and full Bayes methods, both of which use probability distributions called ‘priors’ based on plausible or expected values assigned to the parameters. In empirical
Bayes methods, unlike standard Bayesian methods, the prior distributions are estimated from the distribution of the data for which the prior distribution is fixed. Empirical Bayes may be considered an approximation to a full Bayesian approach which allocates second stage priors to the hyper-parameters controlling the distribution.\textsuperscript{20,24,25} The most important advantage of the Bayesian approach is taking the uncertainty of estimations into account and providing more reliable and robust estimates.\textsuperscript{21,24,26} Poisson regression is a well-known member of the generalized linear models family for considering and modelling count data, such as death number or death rate. There are, however, some limitations to the application of the Poisson model in the context of spatial modeling. First, the regions’ heterogeneity reduces the precision of rate estimates. Moreover, in small areas with rare fatal work-related accidents, the observed number of events might strongly exceed the expected cases in the Poisson model. Due to this variation in the observed number of fatal events, over-dispersion might happen, which lowers the accuracy of rate estimates. Finally, spatial pattern is not taken into account in Poisson modeling. To overcome these limitations, a Bayesian inference was used to estimate the fatal work-related accident rates. We considered a Gamma prior distribution of the variance component of the fatality rate in the overall area of interest.

No previous analyses have been conducted on fatal work-related accident rates and geographical mapping in Iran. The objective of this study was to model Bayesian Poisson-Gamma for fatal work-related accidents and to prepare geographical maps for recording data in 2012.

\section*{Methods}

\subsection*{Study population}

The population of this cross-sectional study included all insured people who had experienced work-related accidents and claimed compensation from the Iranian Social Security Organization (ISSO) between March 21, 2012 (the beginning of the Iranian New Year) and March 21, 2013. The adverse complications of work-related accidents were recorded and documented in a database at the Office of Statistics and Socio-Economic Calculations of the ISSO as death, full recovery, minor disability or fixed compensation, partial disability, and total disability. Data published by the ISSO about the total number of insured people for the considered year were used as the denominator of incidence rates.

\subsection*{Definitions}

\textbf{Total disability}

Any damage other than death, which permanently makes workers incapable of performing the material and substantial duties of their regular occupations, or leads to loss of function of a body organ, or its complete loss, such as loss of both eyes, or an eye, a hand or a foot. About 66% or higher disability is called total disability.\textsuperscript{27}

\textbf{Partial disability}

Any damage other than death or total disability, which leads to loss of functional abilities or complete/partial body organ amputation. Between 33% and 66% disability is called partial disability.\textsuperscript{27}

\textbf{Fixed compensation}

Workers with less than 33% disability are categorized as the fixed compensation category of occupational accident outcomes.\textsuperscript{27}

\subsection*{Ethical issues}

Ethical issues including data fabrication, double publication, and plagiarism were considered and the study proposal was approved by the Ethical Committee of Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Moreover, the ISSO has properly anonymized personal information; therefore, identifiers were not linked to our data and no identifying information of participants (e.g., name, email address, video-recording, etc) was used.

\textbf{Poisson-Gamma modeling}

We considered a prior distribution for the variance component of fatal rate in the overall area of interest. We assumed that all the SIRs, $r_i$, were distributed according to a Gamma distribution with a mean of $\mu = \frac{\alpha}{\tau}$ and a variance of $\tau^2 = \frac{\nu}{\tau^2}$ where $\alpha$ and $\nu$ are scale and shape parameters, respectively. So, the Gamma probability function of $r_i$ is:

$$g(r_i | \alpha, \nu) = \frac{\alpha^{\nu} r_i^{\nu-1} e^{-\alpha r_i}}{\Gamma(\nu)}$$

To obtain empirical Bayes estimates of the SIR given by $r_i = \frac{e_i}{e_i + f_i}$, we had to estimate the mean and variance of the Gamma distribution. Therefore, the marginal probability of observed fatal events which has negative binomial distribution with expected number of events $e_i r_i$, was used to estimate $\mu$ and $\tau^2$ of the gamma distribution. The log-likelihood function of the negative binomial distribution for $\mu$ and $\tau^2$ is:

$$L(\mu, \tau^2) = \sum_i \left[ \ln \left( \frac{r_i}{(\frac{\mu^r}{\tau^r})} \right) + \frac{\mu^r}{\tau^r} \ln \left( \frac{\mu^r}{\tau^r} \right) - (\gamma_i + \frac{\mu^r}{\tau^r}) \ln \left( e_i + \mu^r \right) \right]$$

We can compute the log-likelihood function $L$ for a set of values of $\tau^2$ which maximize $L$ for a given $\mu$.\textsuperscript{16}

\subsection*{Statistical Analysis}

Descriptive analysis of work-related accidents was performed using R 3.0.3 and Open-Bugs 3.2.3 rev 1012 to fit the Poisson-Gamma model. Also, the estimated fatal work-related accident rates in different regions were illustrated in color coded geographical maps using ArcMap 9.3.

\subsection*{Results}

In this cross-sectional study from among all 8,263,077 insured workers, 21,484 work-related accidents leading to injury were registered in the ISSO. About 21,113 (98.3%) of occupational injury victims were men and 371 (1.7%) were women which include 16,443 (76.5%) single and 5,041 (23.5%) married injury victims. The mean age (SD) was 33.2 (9.9) years with the mean ISSO code of 16,932.8 (16.1) and the ISSO code of 16,930.8 (16.1) for men and women, respectively. In terms of occupational activity type, basic metal, electric and non-electrical machinery jobs were the category with the highest rates of work-related accidents (Table 2). The distribution of occupational accident outcomes is presented...
in Table 3. About 2.6% (553) of work-related accidents led to disability (partial and total) or death and 92.8% (19951) of injury victims recovered completely. Moreover, no fatal occupational accidents occurred for women.

Figure 1 shows the comparative maps of observed and estimated relative risk of occupational accidents using the Bayesian Poisson-Gamma model in different provinces for women and men separately. As the figure depicts, Tehran (17.00%) and Isfahan (8.99%) provinces had the highest and South Khorasan (0.32%) and North Khorasan (0.53%) provinces had the lowest rates of work-related accidents.

Similar maps were prepared to represent the estimated relative risk of fatal occupational accidents and disability in different provinces using the Bayesian Poisson-Gamma model compared to the observed data (Figure 2 and Figure 3).

Discussion

In 2012, the work-related accident rate for all workers insured by the Iranian Social Security Organization (ISSO) was 2.6 in 1000. However, there are different estimates of 3.3 and 3.8 work-related accidents in 1000 for a 5-year period in Iran.28,29 Also, this rate was estimated to be 9 in 1000 for Middle Eastern countries in 2006.30 Based on the sex distribution of occupational accidents, injuries occur more frequently for men (98.3%) than women (1.7%). Additionally, during this study, no fatal events were observed for women. The low number of working women, more hazardous jobs for men, different assignment of tasks in the same job, and women’s cautiousness at work could be the reasons for this pattern. Other studies have also reported more frequent occupational accidents for men.28,31,32

In the present study, single workers were more susceptible to...
Figure 1. Comparative maps of the observed and estimated relative risks of occupational accidents using Bayesian Poisson-gamma model for women and men in 2012, Iran

Figure 2. Comparative maps of the observed and estimated relative risks of fatal occupational accidents using Bayesian Poisson-gamma model for men and total population in 2012, Iran

Figure 3. Comparative maps of the observed and estimated relative risks of disability due to occupational accidents using Bayesian Poisson-gamma model for women and men in 2012, Iran
work-related accidents. Disabling and fatal events could be due to insufficient experience and carelessness regarding safety issues. Additionally, occupational injuries were more frequent among those aged 20 – 29 years, which is similar to other studies in Iran. Moreover, different studies around the world have also revealed that younger workers are more vulnerable to work-related accidents.

Related studies have maintained that inexperience, incompetency, youth, courage, employment of younger workers for high-risk jobs, and less attention to safety issues are the most significant risk factors for work-related accidents. Job classification has been conducted by the ISSO in Iran, which is conventional and is not based on international standards. As a result, it can be claimed that some of the occupational categories are lost or their data are not recorded appropriately. In this study, 16% of occupational accidents are placed in the unknown category leading to some limitations on the quality of the information. Therefore, determining priorities, conducting more typical studies and developing registration systems based on ILO recommendations can be helpful tools for providing more efficient preventive strategies by policy makers.

Based on the results, more frequent occupational accidents occurred in basic metal, electric and non-electric machinery, and construction categories, which may be due to the high immigration of less experienced and inadequately trained workers from rural to urban areas. However, other studies have shown that agriculture, fishery, and construction were the job categories with the highest rates of accidents.

Occupational accidents lead to adverse outcomes such as disability, death, and work loss; in this study, partial and total disability, fixed compensation, and death were professional terms used by the ISSO to show these outcomes. Our findings observed complete recovery for the majority of injured workers (93%), while a small number of them died (0.4%). No women were victims of a fatal event which may be related to gender differences discussed earlier. This finding corroborates other studies showing higher fatality rates in work-related accidents for men.

The main purpose of disease mapping is to describe the variation in disease incidence and provide stable local and trend estimations. Using statistical mapping approaches can help to provide more precise estimates. The Bayesian Poisson-Gamma approach was proposed here for geographical mapping of work-related accident rates adjusted for the population heterogeneity which does not include spatial autocorrelation. With regard to the maps of estimated relative risk of occupational accidents using the Bayesian Poisson-Gamma model, the highest estimations pertained to provinces which were mostly located along the mountain chains, some of which are categorized as deprived provinces in Iran. Moreover, significantly higher fatality occurred in Khuzestan which is one of the deprived provinces. Similar studies have shown a correlation between economic and climatic conditions of different areas with occupational accident rates which corroborates the present findings.

In conclusion, this study addresses high risk areas for occupational accidents which should be targeted for monitoring and prevention. The study also reveals the need for further investigation of the role of economic and climatic factors in high risk areas. The application of geographical mapping in addition to statistical approaches can provide more accurate tools for policy makers to make better preventive decisions in order to reduce the risk and adverse outcomes of work-related accidents.

Acknowledgment

This research is part of the PhD thesis in Tarbiat Modares University.

References

26. Banerjee S, Carlin BP, Gelfand AE. Hierarchical modeling and


34. Mosavi ME. Epidemiology and etiology of orthopedic trauma related to work. Tavanbakhoji. 2002; 3(1): 29 – 34. [In Persian]


